Word Count: 1130 Peer Reviewer: Eric Smith

TO: Mr. Yousaf Naseem Khokar, Interior Secretary, Ministry of the Interior

FROM: Neiha Lasharie, Deputy Director of Policy, Directorate-General of Immigration & Passports

SUBJECT: Liberalizing Pakistan's Existing Pilgrimage Visa Regime

DATE: December 8th, 2019

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Pakistan has been unable to meet its economic and political potential in part for two reasons. First, South Asia is the least integrated region in the world, meaning that the region writ large underperforms economically.¹ Second, Pakistan's reputation as an insecure and occasionally intransigent country has stunted its relations with SAARC² member-states and disincentivized tourism (further truncating economic growth).³ Liberalizing Pakistan's visa agreements with SAARC member-states⁴ will help improve Pakistan's regional standing. This may precipitate liberalized visa regimes throughout South Asia; in turn leading to increased intra-regional tourism, thus boosting Pakistan's economy. Pursuant to your request for an actionable and realistic next-step for visa liberalization, I recommend that the Ministry of the Interior (MoI) expand Pakistan's existing pilgrimage visa regime to attract tourists from different faith-backgrounds within SAARC.

BACKGROUND

Pakistan's improving security landscape has revitalized its tourism industry, which contributed to 7.1% of Pakistan's GDP in 2018.⁵ The government has publicly stated its commitment to opening Pakistan up to religious tourism in particular.⁶ The tourism sector in Pakistan is projected to become more

¹ Only 5% of South Asia's total trade comes from intraregional trade, compared to 50% in East Asia and 22% in Sub-Saharan Africa. Sanjay Kathuria, ed., *A Glass Half Full: The Promise of Regional Trade in South Asia*, South Asia Development Forum (Washington DC: World Bank Group, 2018), https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/bitstream/handle/10986/30246/9781464812941.pdf?sequence=8&isAllowed=y, p. 7.

² South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation.

³ There are limited mobility arrangements between SAARC member-states, largely due to mutual distrust and hostilities. Selim Raihan, "Next Steps to South Asian Economic Union: A Study on Regional Economic Integration (Phase II)" (South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation, November 5, 2018), p. 167; Mohd Aminul Karim, "South Asian Regional Integration – Challenges and Prospects," *Japanese Journal of Political Science* 15, no. 2 (June 2014), p. 304; Kathuria, ed., *A Glass Half-Full*; Amita Batra, *Regional Economic Integration in South Asia: Trapped in Conflict?* (Abingdon, New York: Routledge, 2012). The structure of SAARC precludes any attempt to discuss hostilities under its auspices, which only serves to exacerbate the problem. "Article X: General Provisions," *Charter of the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation*. Accessed: http://saarc-sec.org/assets/responsive_filemanager/source/SAARC%20Charter/1_SAARC_CHARTER_Provisional_Rules_of_Procedure.pdf.

⁴ Though SAARC member-states are the targets of this policy recommendation, non-Indian Sikhs are the sole beneficiaries of Pakistan's extant pilgrimage visa regime, and they will thus be included in the scope of this memo. ⁵ In 2018, travel and tourism in Pakistan contributed to 7.1% of total GDP, and 6.3% of total employment. World Travel & Tourism Council, "Travel & Tourism: Economic Impact 2018 Pakistan" (London, United Kingdom: March 2018). Accessed:

https://www.wttc.org/api/sitecore/DownloadForm/DownloadPdf?token=0%2B86MGpBDo3oYcNeueMHmLrvEMyYHm0zuZ1Kqt2%2FBmq%2F%2FsxAkjSGp4hHqvhqKc2KeYuA2IY4qksYnSCPoj%2BzRmnTa%2FNgXDSxllxlHzxdNrfZeTXjl26R6FGx7d7tlxHtj3USa7%2FrFzrztZuOMxncNw%3D%3D.

⁶ The existence of political will means that such a policy suggestion will receive wide political support. "Buddhist Trail' in works to encourage religious tourism," *Newsweek*, December 2, 2019, https://www.newsweekpakistan.com/buddhist-trail-in-works-to-encourage-religious-tourism/; "PTI seeks religious

productive over the next nine years. The direct contribution of travel and tourism to Pakistan's GDP is projected to rise from PKR⁷ 1000 billion to nearly PKR 1800 billion by 2028 – *without* accounting for future visa facilitation policies.⁸ Visa facilitation policies significantly improved tourism rates in G20 countries, paired with the implementation of e-visas.⁹

Moreover, while the demand for tourism exists, most of this tourism comes from outside the SAARC region. Pakistan can fill this tourist disparity by championing a more mobile SAARC through its own policies. The establishment of the Kartarpur Corridor (designed to facilitate visa-free pilgrimage for Indian Sikhs to Gurdwara Darbar Sahib in Pakistan Creates precedent for additional bi- and multilateral regional agreements to facilitate SAARC tourism into Pakistan and vice versa.

EXISTING PILGRIMAGE REGIMES

The MoI only extends pilgrimage visas to members of the Sikh faith, so long as they are not Indian nationals. ¹⁴ This brings up two points: first, while we are a long way away from normalizing relations – let alone movement – between Pakistan and India, that does not preclude Pakistan from improving

tourism for Pakistan: P.M. Khan," *Newsweek*, November 21, 2019, https://www.newsweekpakistan.com/pti-seeks-religious-tourism-for-pakistan-p-m-khan/.

⁸ Taking indirect contributions – that is, contributions arising from the "wider impact" of travel and tourism, through local marketing, purchases made by the hospitality industry to facilitate tourism, etc - into consideration, this amount jumps from PKR 2500 billion to PKR 4200 billion by 2028. World Travel & Tourism Council, "Travel & Tourism: Economic Impact 2018 Pakistan,"

https://www.wttc.org/api/sitecore/DownloadForm/DownloadPdf?token=0%2B86MGpBDo3oYcNeueMHmLrvEMyYHm0zuZ1Kqt2%2FBmq%2F%2FsxAkjSGp4hHqvhqKc2KeYuA2IY4qksYnSCPoj%2BzRmnTa%2FNgXDSxllxlHzxdNrfZeTXjl26R6FGx7d7tlxHtj3USa7%2FrFzrztZuOMxncNw%3D%3D.

⁷ Pakistani Rupee.

⁹ World Travel & Tourism Council, "Visa Facilitation" (London, United Kingdom: August 2019), <a href="https://www.wttc.org/api/sitecore/DownloadForm/DownloadPdf?token=J8adNKookSGe3JdHjTm6%2BUedQWxiqG1VoTZ0X9G0TptleJBFj9aBOr2Mf1hfc31im5CO2h91NZESmHJaXR6pdF5Oq3XsukztUjGlQ%2F3Js%2BU6WgGykLLwA5anLSS5RMLwhVz%2FQe6X%2FVPjxUAY5w%2B0pQ%3D%3D". The Pakistan MoI has already taken the step of mainstreaming e-visas.

¹⁰ Sana Jamal, "Pakistan tops list of world's best travel destinations for 2018," *Gulf News*, December 28, 2017, https://gulfnews.com/world/asia/pakistan/pakistan-tops-list-of-worlds-best-travel-destination-for-2018-1.2148655; Ann Abel, "The 10 Coolest Places to Go in 2019," *Forbes*, December 12, 2018, https://www.forbes.com/sites/annabel/2018/12/12/the-10-coolest-places-to-go-in-2019/#25dc418b1fdc; World Travel & Tourism Council, "Pakistan - 2019 Annual Research: Key Highlights" (London, United Kingdom: 2019). More transparent data on the origins and purpose of international arrivals to Pakistan would be helpful.
¹¹ It would be unwise for Pakistan to remove inbound travel barriers across the board; incremental and strategic growth is crucial. Offering expanded pilgrimage visas to citizens of South Asian countries will be less of a shock to the system. Evaluating this initial step will inform future decisions for visa liberalization agreements, bi- and

multilaterally.

12 One of the holiest shrines in the Sikh faith.

¹³ "Pakistan to open Kartarpur Corridor on November 9: Imran Khan," *India Today*, October 20, 2019, https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/pakistan-to-open-kartarpur-corridor-on-november-9-imran-khan-1611262-2019-10-20.

¹⁴ Specifically, Sikhs who are: a) foreign nationals of Indian origin; b) valid legal and permanent residents of a third country other than India; and c) spouses and children of applicants who fall under subcategory b. Sikh pilgrims are only granted two-week visas to visit Lahore, Rawalpindi, and Sheikhupura. Government of Pakistan Ministry of Interior, "Pilgrim Tourism," https://visa.nadra.gov.pk/pilgrim-tourism/.

relations with other SAARC states. ¹⁵ Second, by limiting pilgrimage visas to Sikhs, Pakistan is unable to reap the social, political, or economic benefits of organized religious tourism ¹⁶ from members of other faiths. ¹⁷

RECOMMENDATIONS

Three major faiths - Buddhism, Hinduism, and Sikhism - can find religious sites of interest in Pakistan. While these religions find purchase all around the world, favoring nationals of SAARC countries for visa facilitation schemes will advance progress towards Pakistan's regional goals and mobility within the region in general.

- 1. Expand access for non-Indian Sikhs under existing regime: Though the pilgrimage visa for non-Indian Sikh pilgrims is only extended to Lahore, Rawalpindi, and Sheikhupura, there are several Sikh pilgrimage sites throughout Pakistan. Expanding pilgrimage access for Sikhs beyond Lahore, Rawalpindi and Sheikhupura will create goodwill among Sikh communities in South Asia and elsewhere toward Pakistan. This will be important for future bi- and multilateral visa agreements.
- 2. Capitalize on existing will to facilitate Buddhist pilgrimages: Despite efforts to destroy sacred Buddhist sites, Pakistan still retains several points of interests for South Asian Buddhists.²⁰ Prime Minister Khan and Buddhist communities globally have publicly stated their desire to see Pakistan become a hub for religious especially Buddhist tourism.²¹ Bhutan and Sri Lanka²² could be special beneficiaries of this scheme.
- 3. Strategically grant access to Hindu sites of pilgrimage: The government will approve of granting Hindus access to sites of pilgrimage, given its recent policy of reclaiming and restoring Hindu temples to the Hindu community of Pakistan.²³ However, relations between Pakistan and the Hindutva Indian government are far too tense to consider expanding access to Hindus of Indian nationality. **Nepal**,

 ¹⁵ Indian citizens are subject to stricter criteria for travel into Pakistan. Government of Pakistan Directorate General of Immigration & Passports, "Visa Policy (for Indian Nationals)," http://www.dgip.gov.pk/Files/VisaforIndian.aspx.
 ¹⁶ This is not to say that religious tourism is completely nonexistent in Pakistan. But the process is decentralized. Advancing *specific* visa categories can make for targeted marketing, while improving the chances of approval for visa applications from more politically sensitive countries.

¹⁷ An important and recent exception is the Kartarpur Corridor, which allows Indian Sikhs access to Gurdwara Darbar Sahib visa-free. The corridor *does not* allow Pakistani Sikhs to access the analogous Gurdwara Dera Baba Nanak in India without first obtaining an Indian visa. This is something the MoI should consider negotiating with India

¹⁸ Pakistan has many important religious sites for Muslim sects, offering pilgrimage visas to whom would also be beneficial to Pakistan's standing in the region. But it is more politically expedient to focus on non-Islamic faiths, as it highlights Pakistan's avowed commitment to pluralism.

¹⁹ Nankana Sahib, Hasan Abdal, and Karachi should be made accessible to Sikh pilgrims.

²⁰ The Taliban in particular targeted Buddhist sites. Fazal Khaliq, "Iconic Buddha in Swat valley restored after nine years when Taliban defaced it," *DAWN*, November 7, 2016, https://www.dawn.com/news/1294246. Takht-i-Bahi, Taxila and Swat could be major attractions for Buddhist pilgrims.

²¹ This includes a will to restore and maintain the sanctity and appearance of sites. Sana Jamal, "Buddhist Monks hope Pakistan can become hub of religious tourism," *Gulf News*, November 2, 2019, https://gulfnews.com/world/asia/pakistan/buddhist-monks-hope-pakistan-can-become-hub-of-religious-tourism-1.67561112.

²² Sri Lanka and Bhutan are majority Buddhist countries, relatively friendly with Pakistan.

²³ "Pakistan to restore, hand over 400 Hindu temples," *India Today*, April 10, 2019, https://www.indiatoday.in/world/story/pakistan-restore-hindu-temples-1498397-2019-04-10.

Bangladesh and Sri Lanka are three South Asian countries with significant Hindu populations that could be granted pilgrimage visas to major Hindu sites.²⁴

4. Use potential successes to facilitate mobility and visa liberalization for Pakistanis: Contingent on the success of and political capital generated by the above steps, Pakistan can negotiation visa agreements loosening restrictions on the mobility of Pakistani nationals. The Mol can condition access to pilgrimage visas for *Indian* Sikhs on allowing Pakistani Sikhs to use the Kartarpur corridor to access Gurdwara Dera Baba Nanak in India, visa-free.²⁵

OVERCOMING POTENTIAL CHALLENGES

CHALLENGE	RESPONSE
Tourism in Pakistan	Religious sites, being limited in scope, can be more readily and
requires the safety and	effectively secured as opposed to the country writ-large. To further
security of tourists. How	streamline this process, the MoI should encourage private tour
can Pakistan ensure the	companies to partner with specific hotels in cities and towns with sites
safety of pilgrims?	of interest. ²⁶ Over time, if the program maintains both its success and
	the security of tourists, then these restrictions can be loosened to allow
	tourists their pick of hotels and the ability to travel more freely in
	Pakistan.
What is the assurance that	The Tehreek-e-Insaaf government has indicated its desire to make
the government will back	Pakistan a destination for religious tourism. It has also indicated a
this move? Why should it?	desire to restore religious sites that have been desecrated. The recent
	establishment of the Kartarpur corridor is an encouraging step. The
	government has also proclaimed its commitment to human rights and
	plurality at multiple international fora – institutionalizing this
	commitment through liberal pilgrimage visas will reinforce Pakistan's
	image.
What does Pakistan have	Liberalizing visa regimes will improve Pakistan's perception in the
to gain from liberalizing its	region by facilitating "people-to-people contact," 27 and leading to
visa regimes?	further bi- and multilateral agreements in the future. Focusing these
	efforts on SAARC countries demonstrates Pakistan's commitment to
	regional integration. A vibrant tourism industry will contribute to
	Pakistan's GDP and overall employment rates. Tourism-based
	employment is projected to generate 5 million jobs in 2028. ²⁸ This
	productivity can only be helped by facilitating religious tourism. Finally,
	bilateral visa facilitation agreements that occur as a result of this

²⁴ Access to Hindu shrines in Sindh alone would be a significant step in extending goodwill.

²⁵ "Allow Pak Sikhs to visit Dera Baba Nanak: Takht jathedar," *Hindustan* Times, November 9, 2019, https://www.hindustantimes.com/chandigarh/allow-pak-sikhs-to-visit-dera-baba-nanak-takht-jathedar/story-yU2XI2cuHzW1qx3AVWGFSL.html. Depending on relations with India, the MoI can also negotiate access for Indian Hindus, or fewer restrictions on Pakistani Muslim pilgrims wishing to visit Sufi shrines in India.

²⁶ Precedent for this exists. The Pakistan Tourism Development Corporation endorses Pakistan Tours Limited and its tourism packages, which even include limited tourism from India to Pakistan and some religious tourism for Sikhs, Buddhists and Hindus. Pakistan Tours Limited, "PTL Transport," http://paktourslimited.com/.

²⁷ "People-to-people contact" is a goal of SAARC; using this specific terminology will underscore Pakistan's desire to be a leader in SAARC. South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation, "Human Resource Development and Tourism," http://saarc-sec.org/areas of cooperation/area detail/human-resource-development-and-tourism/click-for-details 3.

²⁸ World Travel & Tourism Council, "Travel & Tourism: Economic Impact 2018 Pakistan."

endeavor may loosen restrictiveness of the Pakistani passport, allowing
Pakistani nationals to travel more widely.

CONCLUSION

It is in Pakistan's best interest to commit to liberalizing its visa agreements. Expanding pilgrimage visas is an actionable next step that will build upon existing commitments and leadership, and lead to liberalization in other visa regimes. It will have long-term benefits for Pakistan's economy, the livelihood of its people in terms of employment, its internal societal cohesion and pluralism, and its political standing in the region and internationally. Pakistan should expand visa access for Sikhs to other pilgrimage sites in Pakistan; establish pilgrimage visas for Buddhists from SAARC countries; expand the pilgrimage visa to Hindus from SAARC states; and, in return for allowing Pakistani Sikhs access to Gurdwara Dera Baba Nanak, expand the Sikh pilgrimage visa regime to Sikhs from India.

Bibliography

- "Allow Pak Sikhs to visit Dera Baba Nanak: Takht jathedar." Hindustan Times, November 9, 2019. https://www.hindustantimes.com/chandigarh/allow-pak-sikhs-to-visit-dera-baba-nanak-takht-jathedar/story-yU2XI2cuHzW1qx3AVWGFSL.html.
- Ann Abel, "The 10 Coolest Places to Go in 2019," *Forbes*, December 12, 2018. https://www.forbes.com/sites/annabel/2018/12/12/the-10-coolest-places-to-go-in-2019/#25dc418b1fdc
- Armstrong, Shiro Patrick. "East and South Asia: Managing Difficult Bilateral Relations and Regional Integration Globally: East and South Asian Economic Integration." *Asian Economic Journal* 29, no. 4 (December 2015): 303–24. https://doi.org/10.1111/asej.12076.
- Bandyopadhyay, Sumana, André Torre, José Paulo Martins Casaca, and Tomaz Ponce Dentinho, eds. Regional Cooperation in South Asia: Socio-Economic, Spatial, Ecological and Institutional Aspects. Contemporary South Asian Studies. Cham: Springer, 2017.
- Batra, Amita. *Regional Economic Integration in South Asia: Trapped in Conflict?* Routledge Contemporary South Asia Series 64. Abingdon, Oxon; New York, NY: Routledge, 2012.
- Bose, Sugata, and Ayesha Jalal. *Modern South Asia: History, Culture, Political Economy*. 3rd ed. London; New York: Routledge, 2011.
- "Buddhist Trail' in works to encourage religious tourism." Newsweek, December 2, 2019. https://www.newsweekpakistan.com/buddhist-trail-in-works-to-encourage-religious-tourism/.
- "Charter of the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation." South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation, n.d. http://saarc-sec.org/assets/responsive_filemanager/source/SAARC%20Charter/1_SAARC_CHARTER_Provisional_Rules_of_Procedure.pdf.
- Fazal Khaliq. "Iconic Buddha in Swat valley restored after nine years when Taliban defaced it." DAWN, November 7, 2016. https://www.dawn.com/news/1294246.
- "Human Resource Development and Tourism." South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation. Accessed October 27, 2019. http://saarc-sec.org/areas-of-cooperation/area-detail/human-resource-development-and-tourism/click-for-details-3.
- Karim, Mohd Aminul. "South Asian Regional Integration Challenges and Prospects." *Japanese Journal of Political Science* 15, no. 2 (June 2014): 299–316. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1468109914000085.
- Kathuria, Sanjay, ed. *A Glass Half Full: The Promise of Regional Trade in South Asia*. South Asia Development Forum. Washington DC: World Bank Group, 2018. https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/bitstream/handle/10986/30246/9781464812941.pdf?sequence=8&isAllowed=y.

- "Pakistan 2019 Annual Research: Key Highlights." World Travel & Tourism Council, 2019. London.
- "Pakistan to open Kartarpur Corridor on November 9: Imran Khan." India Today, October 20, 2019. https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/pakistan-to-open-kartarpur-corridor-on-november-9-imran-khan-1611262-2019-10-20.
- "Pakistan to restore, hand over 400 Hindu temples." India Today, April 10, 2019. https://www.indiatoday.in/world/story/pakistan-restore-hindu-temples-1498397-2019-04-10.
- "Pilgrim Tourism." Government of Pakistan Ministry of Interior. https://visa.nadra.gov.pk/pilgrim-tourism/.
- "PTI seeks religious tourism for Pakistan: P.M. Khan," Newsweek, November 21, 2019, https://www.newsweekpakistan.com/pti-seeks-religious-tourism-for-pakistan-p-m-khan/.
- "PTL Transport." Pakistan Tours Limited. http://paktourslimited.com/.
- Raihan, Selim. "Next Steps to South Asian Economic Union: A Study on Regional Economic Integration (Phase II)." South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation, November 5, 2018. http://saarc-sec.org/download/downloads/Study SAARC Next Steps to SAEU.pdf.
- Ravi Agrawal, and Kathryn Salam. "South Asia Used to Be the World's Fastest-Growing Region. Now It's Facing an Economic Slowdown." Foreign Policy, October 15, 2019.

 https://foreignpolicy.com/2019/10/15/south-asia-used-to-be-the-worlds-fastest-growing-region-now-its-facing-an-economic-slowdown-world-bank-report-india-gdp-consumption-narendra-modi-kashmir-internet-blackout-pakistan-imran-khan/.
- Sana Jamal. "Buddhist Monks hope Pakistan can become hub of religious tourism." Gulf News, November 2, 2019.
 - https://gulfnews.com/world/asia/pakistan/buddhist-monks-hope-pakistan-can-become-hub-of-religious-tourism-1.67561112.
- Sana Jamal. "Pakistan tops list of world's best travel destinations for 2018." Gulf News, December 28, 2017. https://gulfnews.com/world/asia/pakistan/pakistan-tops-list-of-worlds-best-travel-destination-for-2018-1.2148655.
- Sanjay Kathuria. "Boosting Trade Relations within South Asia." World Bank Blogs (blog), June 28, 2019. http://blogs.worldbank.org/endpovertyinsouthasia/boosting-trade-relations-within-south-asia.
- "Travel & Tourism: Economic Impact 2018 Pakistan." World Travel & Tourism Council, March 2018. London.
 - https://www.wttc.org/api/sitecore/DownloadForm/DownloadPdf?token=0%2B86MGpBDo3oYcNeueMHmLrvEMyYHm0zuZ1Kqt2%2FBmq%2F%2FsxAkjSGp4hHqvhqKc2KeYuA2lY4qksYnSCPoj%2BzRmnTa%2FNgXDSxllxlHzxdNrfZeTXjl26R6FGx7d7tlxHtj3USa7%2FrFzrztZuOMxncNw%3D%3D.
- "Visa Facilitation." World Travel & Tourism Council, August 2019. London.

 https://www.wttc.org/api/sitecore/DownloadForm/DownloadPdf?token=J8adNKookSGe3JdHjTm6

<u>%2BUedQWxiqG1VoTZ0X9G0TptleJBFj9aBOr2Mf1hfc31im5CO2h91NZESmHJaXR6pdF5Oq3XsukztUjGIQ%2F3Js%2BU6WgGykLLwA5anLSS5RMLwhVz%2FQe6X%2FVPjxUAY5w%2B0pQ%3D%3D.</u>

- "Visa Policy (for Indian Nationals)." Government of Pakistan Directorate General of Immigration & Passports. http://www.dgip.gov.pk/Files/VisaforIndian.aspx.
- Wolf, Siegfried O., José Paulo Martins Casaca, Anne J. Flanagan, and Cátia Rodrigues, eds. *The Merits of Regional Cooperation: The Case of South Asia*. Cham; New York: Springer, 2014.
- Yann Doignon. "Growth in South Asia Slows Down, Rebound Uncertain." World Bank, October 13, 2019. https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2019/10/13/growth-in-south-asia-slows-down-rebound-uncertain.